

HUNTERS POINT SHIPYARD
RESTORATION ADVISORY BOARD MEETING MINUTES
4 DECEMBER 2003

These minutes summarize the discussions and presentations from the Restoration Advisory Board (RAB) meeting held from 6:10 P.M. to 8:10 P.M., Thursday, 4 December 2003 at Dago Mary's Restaurant (Building #916 at the Shipyard). A verbatim transcript was also prepared for the meeting and is available in the Information Repository for Hunters Point Shipyard (HPS) and on the Internet at www.efds.w.navy.mil/Environmental/HuntersPoint.htm. The list of agenda topics is provided below. Attachment A provides a list of attendees. Attachment B includes action items that were requested and/or committed to by RAB members during the meeting.

AGENDA TOPICS:

- 1) Welcome/Introductions/Agenda Review
- 2) Approval of Meeting Minutes from 23 October 2003 RAB Meeting
- 3) Subcommittee Reports
- 4) Basewide Groundwater Monitoring Program at HPS
- 5) Future Agenda Topics/Open Question & Answer
- 6) Adjournment

MEETING HANDOUTS:

- Agenda for 04 December 2003 RAB
- Meeting/Minutes from 23 October 2003 RAB Meeting
 - Includes: Action Items from 23 October 2003 RAB Meeting; and
 - Table 1, RAB Roll-Call Sheet
- Monthly Progress Report, October 2003
- PowerPoint Presentation, 2004 Basewide Groundwater Monitoring Program, 04 December 2003
- HPS Environmental Cleanup Newsletter, Summer - Fall 2003
- Meeting Minutes, HPS RAB Economic [Sub]committee, 17 November 2003 with Handout from Chon S. Son
- Meeting Minutes, HPS RAB Membership/Bylaws & Community Outreach Subcommittee, 04 November 2003
- Resolution regarding the Disposition Development Agreement (DDA) between CCSF and Lennar/BVHP
- Flyer, AIGA1, Pop Yo Callaz 4 Matt Gonzalez, 07 December 2003

Welcome / Introductions / Agenda and Meeting Minutes Review

Marsha Pendergrass, facilitator, called the meeting to order at 6:10 P.M. All in attendance made self-introductions. Ms. Pendergrass began the meeting and asked if there were any changes to the agenda; of which there were none. Ms. Pendergrass called for a motion to approve the meeting minutes. Chen Kao, Department of Toxic Substances Control, stated that his affiliation, as stated in the minutes, was incorrect and asked that it be corrected. The proposed amendments were acceptable and the revised meeting minutes were approved pending the revisions.

Ms. Pendergrass reviewed the Action Items contained in the October minutes and asked for a status of each item. Regarding the RAB's recommendation to collect air-quality samples from all future Shipyard fires, Keith Forman, RAB Navy Co-chair, reported that the local Air Quality

1 Management District (AQMD) is starting a program they call the Bayview-Hunters Point
2 Community Air Monitoring Program (BACAMP) which will monitor air quality in the
3 community for approximately 12 months. The AQMD is developing a web site that will post
4 near-real time monitoring data from their monitoring station to be set up at 100 Whitney Young
5 Circle. Mr. Forman said that further information may be obtained by contacting Eric Stevenson
6 at 415-749-4695. The remaining carry-over items were completed to the satisfaction of the RAB.

7 Both of the new action items are to be carried-over. The Navy will address Mr. Mason's question
8 about additional bonding for radioactive waste hauling at the January RAB meeting. Maurice
9 Campbell, RAB member, will provide resolution to the second Action Item at the January RAB
10 meeting.

11 **Navy and Community Co-chair Reports/Other Announcements**

12 Mr. Forman had no announcements. Lynne Brown, RAB Community Co-Chair, stated that a
13 Disposition Development Agreement (DDA) was recently accepted and that he would like to
14 immediately form an Ad-hoc subcommittee to discuss the legality of the agreement and how to
15 stop the transfer. A motion to form an Ad-Hoc DDA Subcommittee was approved. The date and
16 location for the subcommittee meeting will be announced.

17 **Reminder: The next RAB meeting will be held from 6:00 to 8:10 P.M., Thursday evening,**
18 **22 January 2004 at Dago Mary's Restaurant, Building #916 on the Shipyard.**

19 **Subcommittee Updates**

20 **Membership, Bylaws, and Community Outreach Subcommittee (Keith Tisdell, Leader)**

21 Melita Rines, RAB member, gave the report for the Membership, Bylaws and Community
22 Outreach Subcommittee. The meeting was held on December 3rd, so meeting minutes were not
23 yet available. She said that Don Capobres from the San Francisco Redevelopment Agency
24 (SFRA) attended the subcommittee meeting and answered several questions. Ms. Rines made
25 two separate motions to approve Sam Ripley and Lisa Lauulu for RAB membership. Both
26 motions carried and Mr. Ripley and Ms. Lauulu were welcomed to the RAB.

27 The next meeting of the Membership & Bylaws Subcommittee will be 6:00-8:00 P.M., January
28 13th, at the Anna Waden Branch Library.

29 **Economic Development Subcommittee (Maurice Campbell, Leader)**

30 Mr. Campbell said that the subcommittee met on November 17th, and he provided meeting
31 minutes and a handout. The handout was an e-mail from a Navy contracting officer, Chon Son,
32 responding to an inquiry from Mr. Campbell on the status of local contracts, the current status of
33 local contract participation, and more. Mr. Campbell said that he would like to have Navy
34 representatives present at the next Economic Development Subcommittee meeting.

35 Mr. Campbell said the next meeting of the subcommittee will be at 2:30 P.M., January 13th, at the
36 Anna Waden Library.

37 **Technical Review Subcommittee (Lea Loizos, Leader) held jointly with the Risk Review and** 38 **Health Assessment Subcommittee (Karen Pierce, Leader)**

39 Lea Loizos, RAB member, said that the last meeting was very brief and meeting minutes will not
40 be prepared. She said that the meeting was an informal discussion reviewing the NCP.
41 Ms. Loizos also submitted a petition to the Navy that had been signed by numerous community
42 members. After some discussion, Ms. Pendergrass and Mr. Forman felt that the petition should

1 be submitted to the Navy at the conclusion of the RAB meeting since the nature of the petition
2 was non-RAB related. Ms. Loizos withdrew the petition.

3 Ms. Loizos said that the Technical Review Subcommittee will meet at 6:00 P.M., January 14th, at
4 the Community Window on the Shipyard, 4634 Third Street.

5 Radiological Subcommittee (Ahimsa Sumchai, Leader)

6 Dr. Sumchai said the subcommittee did not meet in the past month. Dr. Sumchai introduced
7 Sherlina Nageer from Literacy for Environmental Justice (LEJ) Superfund Schools Project who
8 is working to include the public and private schools are incorporated in the Community
9 Notification Plan (CNP). The next meeting of the subcommittee will be 6:00-8:00 P.M., January
10 21st, at The Greenhouse.

11 Break called (6:55 P.M.)

12 Ms. Pendergrass called the meeting back to order.

13 Basewide Groundwater Monitoring Program at HPS

14 Mr. Forman, Pat Brooks, and Glenn Christensen, Navy, introduced the topic for the Basewide
15 Groundwater Monitoring Program at Hunters Point and said that each of the presenters would
16 take turns making the presentation. Mr. Forman said that the groundwater monitoring program
17 does not get much attention compared to the landfill and other soil contaminant sites, but the
18 Navy is very proud of the groundwater program because it is the first time HPS has had a
19 coordinated comprehensive groundwater monitoring program. Mr. Forman then gave an
20 overview of the evening's presentation. He explained hydrogeology as the study of groundwater
21 and said that the presentation would include information about the groundwater monitoring
22 program in the coming year.

23 Mr. Brooks went into detail on the hydrogeology at HPS. He said there are three water-bearing
24 units at the shipyard – the shallowest being the A-aquifer, followed by an aquitard of
25 impermeable mud, and then the B-aquifer. The Navy showed a computer-animated depiction of
26 the hydrogeology at HPS that clearly and entertainingly illustrated the different water-bearing
27 units. Mr. Brooks said that in relative terms, the A-aquifer has a relatively low permeability and
28 does not yield much water – the bay mud aquitard has almost a 100-fold lower permeability. The
29 permeability of the B-aquifer varies from location to location but is generally very permeable.
30 Mr. Brooks concluded his portion of the presentation by saying that the Navy is monitoring
31 groundwater conditions in each of the three water-bearing units.

32 Mr. Christensen provided information on the purpose of the groundwater monitoring program
33 which is to try and evaluate the impact of the prior industrial operations at HPS. To date, the
34 Navy has 500 monitoring wells at the Shipyard. At about 230 of those locations, the Navy will
35 be collecting samples on a quarterly basis. The Navy also monitors water levels in the wells
36 throughout the Shipyard which helps to identify the groundwater flow direction. Mr. Christensen
37 said this was important because the Navy can track where groundwater contaminant plumes
38 might move and how quickly. The overall purpose of the basewide groundwater monitoring
39 program is to establish consistent data for the feasibility studies that will be implemented in each
40 of the parcels, and to determine areas of concern in order to protect human health and the bay.

41 Mr. Christensen said the program will begin in 2004 with quarterly groundwater samples
42 collected from about 230 wells and water level measurements from the remaining 320 wells.
43 Mr. Christensen said there have been previous sampling investigations at HPS but restated
44 that this is the first coordinated basewide monitoring effort for Parcels B, C, D, and E.

1 Francisco Da Costa, alternate for RAB member Georgia Oliva, asked why Parcel A was not
2 included. Mr. Christensen replied that Parcel A has a No-Further-Action ROD and all
3 investigations have already been completed on Parcel A.

4 Mr. Christensen continued his presentation by providing details on the number of groundwater
5 wells on each parcel and identified plans for additional wells if needed. He also showed a
6 number of existing groundwater contaminant areas throughout the Shipyard. He concluded the
7 presentation and asked for questions from the RAB.

8 Raymond Tompkins, RAB member, asked if the Navy is screening for radioactive contamination
9 in the groundwater, particularly in Parcel C. Mr. Forman replied that radiological investigations
10 will be included in the new draft final Historical Radiological Assessment (HRA) when that is
11 published. Mr. Brooks added that the latest Parcel E Groundwater Data Gaps Investigation report
12 discussed a basewide survey of radiological contaminants and no radioisotopes were found at
13 that time.

14 Mr. Campbell asked for clarification about a potential transfer of A-1 prime and B-1 prime.
15 Mr. Forman replied that he was unaware of these terms or of any potential transfer.

16 Lani Asher, RAB member, asked if determining the quality of the groundwater also determines
17 the type of future development, and also asked for clarification on the different drinking-water
18 quality standards. Mr. Forman replied that the basewide groundwater monitoring program is not
19 part of a site assessment but is only a monitoring program to help provide data on cleanup. Julie
20 Menack, Regional Water Quality Control Board (RWQCB), added that the RWQCB has made a
21 determination that the groundwater at the Shipyard is not potable. The A-aquifer is too saline due
22 to influence from the bay and the groundwater flow rate does not meet the criteria to allow it to
23 be used for drinking-water. She said that the groundwater monitoring program really is not a
24 development issue.

25 Mr. Brown asked what the Navy will do in the event of future El Nino-related flooding,
26 particularly on Parcel B where groundwater is very shallow. Mr. Forman replied that it is up to
27 future developers to address that question.

28 Ms. Laulu asked how long it would take to clean up Parcel E. Mr. Forman replied that current
29 estimates are for 2010.

30 Dr. Sumchai raised the issue of child and/or pet safety and access to the numerous wells on the
31 Shipyard. She also asked if petroleum-based contaminants are excluded from clean-up because
32 of legal exclusions. Mr. Brooks explained that the 500 groundwater monitoring wells are
33 padlocked, while the former wells on Parcel A have all been removed and back-filled with
34 concrete grout. Mr. Brooks also replied that while petroleum contamination is not listed as a
35 CERCLA contaminant, the Navy still monitors it under the Petroleum Program.

36 Mr. Da Costa stated that many of the surrounding hills were leveled in the construction of the
37 Shipyard and the resulting fill has high levels of magnesium [sic]. He asked what scientific
38 standards would be used. Mr. Forman replied that the federal, state, and local standards are
39 clearly specified and are called Applicable, Relevant and Appropriate Requirements (ARARs).
40 The ARARs are tracked by the regulators and the Navy is required to apply them correctly to the
41 cleanup of the Shipyard.

42 Deborah Santana, alternate for RAB member Marie Harrison, asked for clarification on the
43 reported low permeability of the A-aquifer considering that the soil grain matrix has all different
44 sizes. Mr. Brooks replied that it is a little counterintuitive but an aquifer with fairly uniform grain
45 sizes typically has a better permeability than an aquifer with all different sizes of particles.

Ms. Pendergrass closed the question and answer period for the presentation and opened the floor to future agenda topics to be considered for the coming year.

Future Agenda Topics

In addition to the standard agenda topics and subcommittee updates, the following topics were suggested as possible agenda items for future RAB meeting in the coming year:

- Investigation of non-radiological contamination at Formerly Utilized Defense Sites (FUDS) sites,
- Introduction to the Navy's non-CERCLA programs, specifically the Petroleum Program,
- Presentation by SFRA on the A-1 prime and B-1 prime designations,
- General presentation on the basics of CERCLA and the process for environmental cleanup,
- Update on the Parcel E Landfill methane barrier, including identified methane sources,
- Economic impact/benefit of Shipyard cleanup on local community, including how many people are being employed and at what levels by ethnicity and gender,
- Discussion between Navy, SFRA, and RAB on the Redevelopment Plan and desired cleanup levels,
- Resolution on the manganese issue, and
- Petroleum at site IR-18.

Other Discussions/Topics

The following items were also discussed at the RAB meeting. A verbatim account of these discussions is included in the Information Repository for HPS and may also be found on the HPS web page at www.efds.w.navy.mil/Environmental/HuntersPoint.htm

- Responding to the Navy's answer to the Action Item related to the BACAMP project, Ms. Pierce said that RAB member Raymond Tompkins, who initiated the Action Item, would likely not be satisfied with the resolution.
- Sam Ripley and Lisa Lauulu were approved for RAB membership.
- Keith Tisdell, RAB member, announced that the Navy's Information Fair that was held the past Saturday was very informative and beneficial. He thanked the Navy for sponsoring the Fair.

There were no further announcements. The meeting was adjourned at 8:10 p.m.

Reminder: The next RAB meeting will be held from 6:00 to 8:10 P.M., Thursday evening, 22 January 2004 at Dago Mary's Restaurant, Building #916 on the Shipyard.

ATTACHMENT A

4 DECEMBER 2003 - RAB MEETING LIST OF ATTENDEES

Name	Association
1. Christine M. Niccoli	Niccoli Reporting, court reporter
2. Marsha Pendergrass	Pendergrass & Associates
3. Keith Forman	Navy RAB Co-chair
4. Pat Brooks	Navy, Lead RPM
5. Glenn Christensen	Navy
6. Jose Payne	Navy
7. Lee Saunders	Navy, PAO
8. Peter Stroganoff	Navy, ROICC Office
9. Lynne Brown	RAB Community Co-chair , Communities for a Better Environment, CFC
10. Lani Asher	RAB member, Communities for a Better Environment, CFC
11. Barbara Bushnell	RAB member, R.O.S.E.S.
12. Maurice Campbell	RAB member, BDI, CFC, New California Media
13. Francisco Da Costa	Alternate for RAB member Georgia Oliva
14. Charles Dacus	RAB member, R.O.S.E.S.
15. Marie J. Franklin	RAB member, Shoreview Environmental Justice Movement, Inc
16. Marie Harrison	RAB member, CBE, San Francisco Bay View, Greenaction
17. Lisa Lauulu	RAB member, A.I.G.A. 1
18. Lea Loizos	RAB member, ARC Ecology
19. Kevyn Lutton	RAB member, resident
20. Jesse Mason	RAB member, CFC
21. Allen Nunley, Jr.	RAB member, Business owner, resident
22. Karen Pierce	RAB member, Bayview Advocates, BVHP Democratic Club, HEAP
23. Melita Rines	RAB member, India Basin Neighborhood Association
24. Sam Ripley	RAB member, Samoan American Media Service
25. Ahimsa Sumchai	RAB member, Bayview-Hunter Point Health & Env Resource Center
26. Keith Tisdell	RAB member, resident
27. Raymond Tompkins	RAB member, BVHP Coalition on the Environment
28. Leilani Wright	RAB member, JRM Associates
29. Amy Brownell	RAB member, SF Dept of Public Health
30. Chen Kao	RAB member, Cal Dept Toxic Substances Control
31. Jackie Lane	RAB member, US EPA
32. Julie Menack	RAB member, SF Regional Water Quality Control Board
33. Arvind Acharya	Innovative Technical Solutions, Inc
34. Andrew Bozeman	Southeast Sector Community Development Corp
35. Jim Bunger	Golden Gate Railroad Museum
36. Linda Carlsen	Attendee
37. Marissa Fong	Habitat for Humanity
38. Miguel Galarza	Yerba Buena Engineering and Construction, Inc
39. Mape Galuega	A.I.G.A. 1
40. Bob Hocker	Lennar/BVHP
41. Carolyn Hunter	Tetra Tech EM Inc
42. Patrick Ioane	A.I.G.A. 1
43. Ronald Keichline	Innovative Technical Solutions, Inc
44. Lafo Lauulu	Resident
45. Debra Moore	Innovative Technical Solutions, Inc
46. Sherlina Nageer	Literacy for Environmental Justice
47. John Nauer	A.I.G.A. 1
48. Danielle Pacifico-Cogan	Office of Congresswoman Nancy Pelosi
49. Charles Pardini	Levine-Fricke for Lennar
50. Dennis Robinson	Shaw Environmental & Infrastructure, Inc

- | | |
|----------------------|--|
| 51. Deborah Santana | Mills College Ethnic Studies Dept |
| 52. Clifton J. Smith | CJ Smith and Assonates, Eagle Environmental Construction |
| 53. Bill Vaovasa | United Samoan Pentecotal |
| 54. Peter Vaovasa | A.I.G.A. 1 |
| 55. Julia Vetromile | Tetra Tech EM Inc |
| 56. Stefanie Yow | Office of Congresswoman Nancy Pelosi |

ATTACHMENT B**4 DECEMBER 2003 - RAB MEETING
ACTION ITEMS**

Item No.	Action Item	Due Date	Person/Agency Committing to Action Item	Resolution Status
Carry-Over Items				
1.	Navy to provide information to Jesse Mason regarding additional bonding/radio active waste hauling certifications, if any.	January RAB	Navy/ITSI	
2.	Economic Subcommittee to prepare a letter in support of Section 2912, Defense Authorization Act, establishing preference for local businesses.	January RAB	M. Campbell	
New Items				
1.	None			